



**AMENDED MINUTES
JOINT MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION AND
THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
NAVE OF THE COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA
FEBRUARY 8, 2006**

PRESENT: Steve Steinberg, Chairman, Planning Commission
James Heitel, Vice-Chairman, Planning Commission (arrived 4:00)
David Barnett, Commissioner, Planning Commission
Eric Hess, Commissioner, Planning Commission (arrived 4:00)
Kevin O'Neill, Commissioner, Planning Commission
Steven Steinke, Commissioner, Planning Commission
Ed Wimmer, Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission
George Hartz, Vice-Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner, Historic Preservation Commission
Dezbah Hatathli, Commissioner, Historic Preservation Commission
Kathy Howard, Commissioner, Historic Preservation Commission

ABSENT: Jeffrey Schwartz, Commissioner, Planning Commission
Paul Winslow, Commissioner, Historic Preservation Commission

STAFF PRESENT: Bob Cafarella
Mac Cummins
Tim Curtis
Lusia Galav
Randy Grant
Frank Gray
Don Meserve
Sherry Scott
Kira Wauwie

1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

CALL TO ORDER

A joint meeting of the Scottsdale Planning Commission and the Scottsdale Historic Preservation Commission was called to order by Chairman Steinberg and Chairman Wimmer at 3:35 p.m.

INTRODUCTIONS

At the invitation of Chairman Wimmer, the Commissioners introduced themselves.

Noting that he was appointed to fill the architect position required by the Ordinance, Chairman Wimmer reported he is currently serving his fourth year on the Historic Preservation Commission. He elaborated that before coming to Scottsdale in 1993 from Kansas City he had an architectural practice and served as an advisor for numerous Commissions. Since he has been Chairman, one of his main objectives has been to establish a smooth working relationship between the Historic Preservation Commission and other groups in Scottsdale.

Chairman Wimmer expressed his hope to have the Members of the Historic Preservation Commission give an explanation of their duties and for the Planning Commission Members to suggest ways for the Planning Commission and Historic Preservation Commission to effectively work together.

Commissioner Nancy Dallet reported she is a historian specializing in twentieth century American history with an interest in water. She works at ASU in the Public History Program. She opined that the history of buildings tells a story about the fabric and uniqueness of an area, which is why she was attracted to the Historic Preservation Commission.

George Hartz, Vice-Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission, reported that he first moved to Scottsdale in 1968 and this is his third year on the Commission. He noted that history is his avocation and he is involved in quite a few history organizations, including chairing the Community Outreach Committee.

Dezbah Hatathli, Historic Preservation Commission, reported she is originally from the Navajo Nation of northeastern Arizona and came to Scottsdale ten years ago. Her degree is in Anthropology with Native American Studies and she specializes in Native American Anthropology, touching on Southwestern and historic archeology.

Kathy Howard, Historic Preservation Commission, stated she has a Ph.D. in history from the Public History Program at ASU. She noted her areas of interest are American Southwest and Native American history and she works as an independent consultant on exhibits and publications for the Heard Museum and Mesa Verde National Park, among others. She has lived in the Valley since 1946 and was employed by Motorola for 21 years. Her special interest with the Commission is in historic neighborhoods.

Steve Steinberg, Chairman, Planning Commission, reported he has been a member of the Commission for four years. He has been an architect for twenty-five years and has preservation experience in the New York area. In the past he was involved with construction and commercial real estate.

Kevin O'Neill, Planning Commission, reported having served on the Development Review Board. He was recently appointed to the Planning Commission. He was raised in Scottsdale, has a degree in architecture from ASU, and owns a residential development company. He commented that he is looking forward to serving on the Planning Commission and being a part of maintaining Scottsdale's uniqueness.

David Barnett, Planning Commission, noted that he is in finance with a master's in public policy. He commented that his interest in the Planning Commission was from a policies and procedures standpoint. He noted that he appreciates the dichotomy of working with the Development Review Board in order to make recommendations to City Council.

Steve Steinke, Planning Commission, reported he is in his third year on the Planning Commission and he has lived in Scottsdale since 1997. He has twenty years of experience serving in elected and appointed positions in Illinois. He commented that historic preservation can reach into the private sector, and it is critical to recognize that it needs to be carefully approached.

2. **REPORT/DISCUSSION**

Chairman Wimmer stated that the Historic Preservation Commission would like to work closely with the Planning Commission and the Green Building Committee to maintain historical importance combining architectural, urban, and resource preservation.

Chairman Wimmer spoke of staff member Debbie Abele who is a Scottsdale historic preservation officer and a key consultant for the Historic Preservation Commission. He announced that she has been appointed by FEMA to assess hurricane damage to historic properties in New Orleans.

Commissioner Dallett is the Chairman of a sub-committee of the Historic Register Committee, focusing on Taliesin. She reported Taliesin has been on the National Registry for a long time and has just recently been added to the Arizona Registry. She opined that the most important thing to get from this meeting is information regarding how best to approach the Taliesin presentation, which will go before the Planning Commission in two weeks.

Vice-Chairman Hartz mentioned his involvement as Chairman of the Community Outreach Committee. He noted that part of the function of the Historic Preservation Commission is to promote community education in order to further the appreciation of the community and the importance of preserving Scottsdale's heritage.

Chairman Steinberg introduced Commissioners Heitel and Hess who arrived during the discussion.

Jim Heitel, Planning Commission Vice-Chairman, introduced himself, noting that he is a third generation Arizonan and owns horse property in north Scottsdale. He mentioned that he is in the development business and that his primary reason for becoming involved with the Planning Commission four years ago was preservation of the northern areas.

Eric Hess, Planning Commission, introduced himself, noting that he is in real estate and his involvement with the Planning Commission began two-and-a-half years ago. He commented that his objectives and interests originally were desert preservation and maintaining the character and quality that Scottsdale represents.

Commissioner Hatathli mentioned that she serves on the Outreach Committee and her involvement as supervisor of the environmental program of the Salt River Maricopa/Pima American Indian Community. She noted one of the challenges of the Historic Preservation Commission as development spreads is to preserve and protect the irreplaceable resources that make Scottsdale unique.

Commissioner Howard commented that she is the Chair of the Scottsdale Register Committee which has been working on a survey to select the best representation of 1950's neighborhoods. She noted there is a seventeen step program in order to designate a neighborhood historic and the first two neighborhoods, which are located near Coronado High School, were selected in June 2005 by the City Council. She gave a brief overview of the history of the neighborhoods and their correlation with Motorola's establishment of two production facilities. Commissioner Howard mentioned that housing guidelines are being developed and the City has made grants available to homeowners who are interested in restoring their homes. She opined that these neighborhoods contribute to the mix of what it means to be Scottsdale, uniting the old with the new.

Chairman Wimmer clarified that the committees that have been previously mentioned are comprised of citizens outside of the Historic Preservation Commission. He distributed handouts depicting the ordinance that enabled the formation of the Historic Preservation Commission, a copy of the 2006 Work Program, and a list of Scottsdale properties already listed on the register.

Chairman Steinberg discussed concerns the Planning Commission has with historic designations. He noted that the Commission would like to understand how informed homeowners are prior to designation, especially with regards to property rights. He suggested the two boards meet together in study session a month before bringing any case to the Planning Commission so questions and misconceptions can be addressed.

Chairman Steinberg mentioned the Planning Commission would like to be provided with information on the benefits and programs that are available to homeowners, including programs for preservation and rehabilitation. In response to inquiry concerning a walking tour guidebook, Chairman Steinberg was presented with the existing Scottsdale guidebook.

Vice-Chairman Heitel addressed clarifying rights for owners, noting that single owners of commercial property seem to be more knowledgeable than homeowners about the process of acquiring a historical designation. He opined that it is important that homeowners be aware of not only the benefits of such a designation, but also the ramifications and loss of property rights. He suggested the Historical Preservation Commission could break down the process of disclosure when presenting a case. Using the example of a neighborhood that came before the Planning Commission and asked only for some height restrictions in their neighborhood, Vice-Chairman Heitel asked whether there are other mechanisms available to achieve the results the Historical Preservation Commission is trying to accomplish. He noted that when these designations are made they are irreversible. Owners need to be aware of what is being taken away.

Commissioner Hess commented that he is unclear about the process the Historical Preservation Commission goes through to determine that a neighborhood will be a historical preservation site. He opined there should be a precise method used to determine the will of the neighborhoods, noting that the methods of open houses and casual polling are inaccurate. He elaborated that the "majority" may not be a fair assessment, since it could mean 51% or 98%. Commissioner Hess clarified that if the conduct of a poll is too casual it may be imprecise and there is a risk of infringing on people's property rights.

Commissioner O'Neill opined that personal property rights are important and he has an interest in learning more about "spot preserving" instead of total overlay. He was surprised at the process of seeking out areas for designation as opposed to individuals applying for the designation, noting that he is interested to see which neighborhoods are being considered for historic designations.

Commissioner Barnett clarified that from a processing standpoint, the historic property overlay is the most restrictive zoning code. He agreed with Commissioner Hess that sufficient accurate data needs to be collected. He noted that people should be informed of options other than establishing a restrictive overlay historic designation. Commissioner Barnett mentioned that it is not the role of the government to use data from non-data driven departments to convince people that their property values will increase. It is especially important for people to be aware of the effect a historic designation may have with their lending institution; whether good or bad, it could effect the restrictions banks put on them.

Commissioner Steinke agreed with fellow Commissioners, opining that one thing the Commissions need to work together on is the process and informing the people of their options. He questioned how a historic overlay would effect development issues. Noting that both Commissions envision preservation of Scottsdale, he requested that the Planning Commission be kept informed throughout the process.

Vice-Chairman Heitel reiterated that property owners need to be fully aware of the position they will be in once a historic designation is applied. He suggested the Historic Preservation Commission could, under certain circumstances, recommend certain zoning restrictions or development restrictions in lieu of a historic overlay.

Commissioner Hess suggested forming a working group made up of Commissioners and staff to develop an acceptable process and a list of questions that should be answered before coming to the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Barnett suggested having members of the Planning Commission rotate on the Historic Preservation Commission.

Chairman Wimmer mentioned one thing decided by the Historic Preservation Commission is that a Commissioner will be making the presentations to the Planning Commission instead of staff. He noted that he was glad to hear the Planning Commissioner's interest in work sessions, because the Historic Preservation Committee also thinks that work sessions would be advantageous.

Commissioner Dallett clarified that it is proper for the City to be the Applicant, because the Historic Preservation Commission decides eligibility. In response to

inquiry by Commissioner O'Neill concerning "spot preserving", Commissioner Dallett clarified that there is room for non-contributing structures in a historic neighborhood. She noted that it is not in the Historic Preservation Commission's purview to conduct formal surveys; suggesting that that Ordinance may need to be addressed. She recommended that Planning Commissioners review the Historic Preservation Commission's frequently asked questions.

3. **ADJOURN JOINT MEETING**

With no further business to discuss, the joint meeting of the Scottsdale Planning Commission and the Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
A/V Tronics, Inc.